
In the Supreme Court of the United States

MARGARET L. HOSTY, JENI S. PORCHE, AND STEVEN P. BARBA,
PETITIONERS,

v.

PATRICIA CARTER, RESPONDENT.

**On Petition for a Writ of Certiorari
to the United States Court of Appeals
for the Seventh Circuit**

BRIEF IN OPPOSITION

LISA MADIGAN
Attorney General of Illinois

GARY FEINERMAN
Solicitor General

MARY E. WELSH*
*Assistant Attorney General
100 West Randolph Street
Chicago, Illinois 60601*

*Counsel of Record

(312) 814-2106

Counsel for Respondent

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
QUESTION PRESENTED	i
TABLE OF CONTENTS	ii
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
STATEMENT	1
REASONS FOR DENYING THE PETITION	8
I. Given Petitioners’ Concession That Judges Disagree Over If and How <i>Hazelwood</i> Applies to Colleges, They Necessarily Concede the Judgment Against Them Was Correct	10
II. This Case Is a Poor Vehicle For Determining If and How <i>Hazelwood</i> Applies to Post-Secondary Schools	13
III. The Seventh Circuit’s Opinion Creates No Certworthy Conflict With Any Opinion by This Court or the Other Circuits	16
A. The Seventh Circuit’s Use of Forum Analysis Creates No Certworthy Conflict	16
B. The Seventh Circuit’s Holding That Dean Carter Was Entitled to Qualified Immunity Creates No Certworthy Conflict	19
C. The Seventh Circuit’s Opinion Creates No Certworthy Conflict With <i>Healy</i> and Its Progeny.	21
CONCLUSION	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases:	Page
<i>Anderson v. Romero</i> , 72 F.3d 518 (7th Cir. 1995)	20
<i>Arkansas Educ. Television Comm’n v. Forbes</i> , 523 U.S. 666 (1998)	16
<i>Axson-Flynn v. Johnson</i> , 356 F.3d 1277 (10th Cir. 2004)	19
<i>Belda v. Marshall</i> , 416 F.3d 618 (7th Cir. 2005)	15
<i>Bishop v. Aronov</i> , 926 F.2d 1066 (11th Cir. 1991)	19
<i>Bd. of Regents of Univ. of Wis. v. Southworth</i> , 529 U.S. 217 (2000)	11, 18
<i>Brown v. Li</i> , 308 F.3d 939 (9th Cir. 2003)	12-13, 20
<i>Bunting v. Mellen</i> , 541 U.S. 1019, 124 S. Ct. 1750 (2004)	15
<i>California v. Rooney</i> , 483 U.S. 307 (1987) (<i>per curiam</i>)	10
<i>Cornelius v. NAACP Legal Defense & Educ. Fund, Inc.</i> , 473 U.S. 788 (1985)	16
<i>Gay Lesbian Bisexual Alliance v. Pryor</i> , 110 F.3d 1543 (11th Cir. 1997)	18
<i>Hazelwood Sch. Dist. v. Kuhlmeier</i> , 484 U.S. 260 (1988)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Healy v. James</i> , 408 U.S. 169 (1972)	21-23

<i>Int'l Soc. for Krishna Consciousness, Inc. v. Lee</i> ,	
505 U.S. 672 (1992)	16
<i>Kincaid v. Gibson</i> ,	
191 F.3d 719 (6th Cir.), <i>vacated</i> , 197 F.3d 828	
(6th Cir.1999), 236 F.3d 342 (6th Cir. 2001)	
(<i>en banc</i>)	11-14, 18, 20
<i>Lehman v. City of Shaker Heights</i> ,	
418 U.S. 298 (1984)	16
<i>Papish v. Bd. of Curators of the Univ. of Mo.</i> ,	
410 U.S. 667 (1973)	21-23
<i>Perry Educ. Ass'n v. Perry Local Educators' Ass'n</i> ,	
460 U.S. 37 (1983)	14, 16
<i>Regan v. Taxation With Representation</i> ,	
461 U.S. 540 (1983)	18
<i>Regents of Univ. of Mich. v. Ewing</i> ,	
474 U.S. 214 (1985)	17
<i>Rosenberger v. Rector & Visitors of the Univ. of Va.</i> ,	
515 U.S. 819 (1995)	14, 17-19, 21-23
<i>Rust v. Sullivan</i> ,	
500 U.S. 173 (1991)	18
<i>Saucier v. Katz</i> ,	
533 U.S. 194 (2001)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Student Gov't Ass'n v. Univ. of Mass.</i> ,	
868 F.2d 473 (1st Cir. 1989)	20
<i>Tinker v. Des Moines Indep. Cmty. Sch. Dist.</i> ,	
393 U.S. 503 (1969)	17, 21
<i>United States v. American Library Ass'n, Inc.</i> ,	
539 U.S. 194 (2003)	16
<i>Widmar v. Vincent</i> ,	
454 U.S. 263 (1981)	17, 18
<i>Wilson v. Layne</i> ,	
526 U.S. 603 (1999)	10, 23